

**San Francisco Food Security Task Force (FSTF)
Food Empowerment Market Meeting Minutes**

December 13, 2021

Members present: Paula Jones (DPH Food Security); Cissie Bonini (EatSF/UCSF); Tiffany Kearney (DAS); Rita Mouton-Patterson (Hospitality House); Chester Williams (Community Living Campaign); Priti Rane (DPH-MCAH); Jennifer Lebarre (SFUSD); Michelle Kim (DCYF)

Also present: Cindy Lin (HSA/Food Coordination Group); Tommy McClain (HSA/Food Coordination Group); Cathy Huang (HSA/Food Coordination Group); Fiona McBride (HSA/Food Coordination Group); Susie Smith (HSA); John McCormick (TNDC Healthy Corner Store Coalition); Cathy Davis (Executive Director, Bayview Senior Services); William Goodness (On Lok 30th Street Senior Center); Larry Brucia (Sutti and Associates); Meredith Terrell (Meals on Wheels San Francisco); Sara Draper-Zivetz (The SF Market); Luis Vasquez Gomez (La Raza Community Resource Center); Gabriel Medina (La Raza CRC); Tony Kelly (Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates); Sean Brooks (San Francisco-Marin Food Bank); Chidera Ofaha (Rafiki Coalition); Wallace Fung (Community Youth Center); Janna Cordeiro (Food as Medicine Collaborative); Linda (Homeless Prenatal Program/Patient Pantry); Katie Merriman (Director of Food and Nutrition Services at ZSFG); Anthony Khalil (Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates); Gwendolyn Westbrook (UCHS); Geoffrea Morris (Legislative Aide for Supervisor Ahsha Safai in District 11); SFAAFB Coalition; Bishop Burch; Linda H; Aarya; Alex; Amanda Curran; David Juarez; Diana Doyle; DJ Siegman; Gabriela Aleman (Mission Meals), Haley Nielson (Farming Hope); Jill Fox (India Basin Neighborhood Association); Kaleda Walling; La Shon Walker; Lea Troeh (EatSF/UCSF); Linda Siegman; Lyslynn Lacoste; Madeline; Michael Wirkkala; Michelle Lewis; Nikki Pearl; Patsy Tito; Sandra Francisco; SDDT Program; Tacing Parker (YMCA); Tanis Crosby (SF-Marin Food Bank), Tina Gonzales (SF-Marin Food Bank); Meg Davidson (SF-Marin Food Bank); Emily Pham (Homeless Prenatal Program); Veronica Shepard (SFDPH); Khadijah; Carolyn Lasar (SFMarket); Michael Pon (EatSF/UCSF); Larry McClendon (OEWD); bvhadvocates

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION ITEM
1. Call to order	Cissie Bonini called the meeting to order 2:02pm	None
2. Welcome, Member Roll Call, Introductions	Cissie welcomed everyone. Members of the public introduced themselves in the chat.	None
3. General Public Comment	None	None
4. HSA Food Coordination Group Introduction & Meeting Overview,	Cindy introduced herself and her team and gave an overview of the meeting. Cindy provided the purpose of today's meeting and discussed the guidelines for today's discussion.	None

<p>Cindy Lin (HSA Food Coordination Group) [Discussion item] a. Public Comment</p>	<p>No public comments.</p>	
<p>5. Food Empowerment Market Legislation Overview, Cindy Lin (HSA Food Coordination Group)</p>	<p>Cindy provided an overview of the Ordinance.</p> <p>Public Comment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tacing Parker asks how is eligibility determined/verified • Cindy Lin responds that this has not yet been decided, but she will share research on what other jurisdictions have done. • Geoffrea Morris responded CalFresh card, letter from social worker, MediCal card, other verification that people have had to provide historically • Chester William responded seniors in need, asking for culturally relevant foods, there should be a priority given to that age group, particularly those are who disabled • Meredith Terrell responded that the hardest to reach can be those who have a hard time providing documentation, might be better to have others vouch for them rather than relying on the client to provide that • La Shon Walker responded: in order for residents to receive public assistance, they have to have proven eligibility, should not be the FEM that verifies or turn anyone away; eligibility verification should come before the center <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Number of people agree in the chat • Jonathan McCormick thinks maybe there shouldn't be eligibility requirements, and that anyone, working or not, should be able to get food if they are hungry. • Veronica Shepard responds: Whatever the eligibility process is a person should not be policed to receive food; How would you do this with an undocumented resident; we need to define "working class" you may not be on this list but still struggling and you can be working class and have a six-figure income • Gabriela Aleman: How would someone not already engaged in services and doesn't have an address prove their eligibility? • Paula Jones responded: Many people who are not eligible for benefits still need food support - they should be able to be included; Input - People that may 	<p>None</p>

	<p>have a housing subsidy should be included in the eligibility</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jennifer LeBarre responded: Referred by case workers, EBT card • David Juarez: I’m an owner/resident of a proposed site, how is this market going to provide quality food to all? It appears this legislature appears to only aid a certain demographic in this community, we all should have the right to qualify food. None of the four components discussed of this program includes everyone, only low income. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cindy Lin clarifies there are no proposed or pre-designated sites based on a comment where someone said they worked at a proposed site. • La Shon Walker: We have markets with food to purchase but nothing like this; So this RFP is for an operator? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cindy Lin responded: Yes the RFP is for an operator and the operator/proposal may propose a site along with their proposal • Bishop Burch: Will the market provide hot meals? • Gwendolyn Westbrook: How are we going to decide who can receive this food? Many people are working but do not have money for food. <p>2. Jill Fox asked if the facility would have food available for purchase?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy Lin responded yes. She also notes this is an important question and will be a main topic of conversation later in the meeting. 	
<p>6. Presentation of research related to food empowerment market legislation requirements, Cindy Lin (HSA Food Coordination Group)</p>	<p>Cindy provided a summary of the Food Coordination Group’s research on similar models across the country, including key lessons learned.</p> <p>Comments from FSTF:</p> <p>1. Paula Jones: Did you look into Brad Paisley’s store (The Store) in Tennessee?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds Yes, but we did not include as they did not have the capacity to engage with us. • Geoffrea Morris informed the group that she had reached out The Store, and toured it. The Store 	<p>Post presentation slides</p>

	<p>operates as a year round free grocery store allowing people to shop for their basic needs. Geoffrea also received from them job descriptions for the positions. The Store is a partnership and includes Belmont University, The Children’s Hospital, Kroger Foundation, Sysco, as well as other partners.</p> <p>2. Rita Mouton-Patterson: As far as the employees who handle the food, hopefully the money paid to them is top dollar. We have to have people who are experienced and educated, make sure the food is safe and tasty.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agreement in chat <p>Public Comment:</p> <p>1. Tony Kelly: Hoping this presentation will be available after the meeting?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Paula Jones responded: The presentation will be posted on the Food Security Task Force webpage www.sfdph.org/foodsecurity <p>2. Larry Brucia: In your research, did you get what costs it takes to get the Market up and running...ie. Tenant Improvements, equipment, permits etc.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy indicates that all programs have start-up costs, but the costs range significantly because of scale and number of people served. <p>3. Janna Cordeiro: This chart doesn’t include the number of people served? In our legislation, are there participant goals? Number of people annually who will benefit?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds that this is correct as numbers can be different per component and we are launching a pilot which isn’t comparable. There are no participant goals in the Ordinance. <p>4. Meredith Terrell: Do you have the stats on how many clients are served by each program?</p> <p>5. Sara Draper-Zivetz: Were those cost estimates annual?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds Yes <p>6. Jennifer Lebarre: Is benefits referring to employee benefits?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds that no this is referring to benefits linkage to services such as CalFresh <p>7. Jennifer Lebarre: minimum pay?</p>	
--	--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds that Yes, they will follow ordinance for minimum wage <p>8. Veronica Shepard: Just for clarity, is there two RFP's, one to secure funding to be the Empowerment site and one for an org to manage? Or is this RFP to do both?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds that there will just be one RFP to secure the operator; HSA will fund the Market <p>9. Sandra Francisco: Did you mention that Daily Table in Dorchester, MA has multiple markets? Does any part of this also offer food purchases to members of the geographic community around the location who might not qualify under the four criteria in the City's guideline?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds that this was created by one of the Founders of Trader Joe's. It is a paid market; people are able to pay for food with heavy discounts <p>10. Meredith Terrell: Volunteer management requires support and is thus not free labor.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy affirms this point <p>11. Geoffrea Morris: I was able to tour Brad Paisley's store. It is a branch of Belmont College, and it is not solely funded by Brad Paisley. It is linked to the Food Bank, as well as philanthropy. They serve 100-200 families a week, and it is free.</p> <p>12. Veronica Shepard: We shouldn't consider asking people to "volunteer" on a regular basis as that is actually work and people should be paid to support this effort. If this is about food empowerment, then this effort should also include economic empowerment for populations that have been hit hard economically.</p> <p>13. Khadijah: We should also consider helping create business. Economics is really important. One thing to sustain is to help people who live in the community create business.</p> <p>14. La Shon Walker: RFP should include language around Operator's experience with equity. There have been a lot of conversations around food empowerment, all conversations have included culturally relevant food, that workers are paid a fair wage and that they represent the community that they're serving. The Operator has to value all that.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy responds that this is a part of all of HSA's RFPs. We definitely encouraged collaboration in our summer RFPs and perhaps that is a good way to go about this <p>15. Cathy Davis: We need to make sure that people are hired from the community after the initial phase. Everyone hires from the community in the beginning, but often it is not sustained over time.</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>16. Veronica Shepard: How will the community be a part of the RFP process beyond this meeting? OEWD, utilized community panelist that assisted with reviewing RFPs. They read, scored and weighed in on the RFPs and were paid for their time and inputs. Will HSA consider this type of community insights?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cissie indicates that we do not have time for this question 	
<p>7. Questions for Community Feedback, Cindy Lin (HSA Food Coordination Group) [Discussion item] a. Public comment</p>	<p><u>Discussion Question 1: Should the FEM be open to all community members?</u></p> <p>FSTF Members:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comments/questions <p>Public Comments:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Meredith Terrell: Is there a way to make this RFP process more approachable than the "regular" process. Submitting an RFP and being a contractor of CCSF is a language of its own and has its own rules and processes. 2. Lyslynn Lacoste: All are fine with me, but what is important is how is it regulated? It might be a lot of work to prove that you live in the BVHP. It might be a lot to manage. 3. Jennifer Lebarre: If you can ensure that by allowing those to purchase can help the financial health of the market while not diminishing the supply chain for the intended residents. 4. Janna: We've seen so many tensions in food lines and that is hard on everyone... folks needed to access food as well as staff/volunteers helping to distribute food. It's very hard to know that if you have a market/shopping model if those tensions will be disbursed or not. 5. Gabriela: If it were to be limited, how would that be restricted? Here at Mission Meals, we don't restrict, but we do see that a lot of our clients are not from the zip code we are trying to target. If someone can prove they live/work/go to school in the district that may be more equitable. 6. Chester Williams: I agree completely. I think there should be something written into the proposal that it starts in the designated community, then maybe in the future say 6months or more, then there is a chance to expand. But in the beginning, I vote to restrict it to the 	

	<p>Bayview, where needs are already great but can expand later as we see how it goes.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 7. Jill Fox: I think there should be food available for purchase. That way any profits can go toward subsidizing the people who cannot pay. It also builds community if everyone is shopping in the same place. For purchase, people can buy from anywhere (for example people working in the neighborhood or visiting the neighborhood can leave some money behind). 8. DJ Siegman: My thoughts are to open the market up to the area that it serves and restrict access from other neighborhoods, especially if it is a pilot program. Residents outside of the stated categories could contribute to the overall cost by being able to purchase items at a different cost--a way of offsetting costs--but not in a way of stigmatizing others. 9. Khadijah: With the lens of equity, everyone that needs support should be served. I do not think that the people in the market should decide who should have access. You could also have hours for the specific community. Like stores are doing - senior hours for example. There needs to be better way to market to the community and let them know they can access to the services. 10. There are many comments in the Chat Box indicating an interest in a hybrid model in which those who can afford to pay do, and help subsidize free food for others. The group is torn on whether to restrict access or not, but in terms of zip codes and income level. Also a lot of support for high quality food in the Chat. 11. David Juarez: The "quality" food must be "quality" otherwise no one will want to buy the food and it will remain as a free service. I believe the market should help all community members and not just one demographic. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Agreement from Janna C 12. Sean Brooks: Ideally there would be an integrated network of FEM's and other charitable food distributions, so no one has to serve everyone. Better to start small for pilot to build and expand on success. 13. Sandra Francisco: A hybrid model that benefits the targeted groups as well as residents in the geographic area would be helpful. Persons who can pay could pay full costs. This would help to support the non-profit. Quality food and choices in food are important. 14. Veronica Shepard: My understanding is that the FEM is for low-income community so we should keep in mind household level impact. We can think of 	
--	--	--

	<p>complementary programs outside of this program. The pilot is not going to answer all of our questions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Cindy Lin: There will eventually be other Food Empowerment Markets in other districts, and that there can be different phases of participation. <p>15. Sean Brooks: Quality produce takes a lot of work/gleaning. Supermarkets work hard to manage their produce quality.</p> <p>16. Jennifer Lebarre: Concern about different hours- would that stigmatize different populations?</p> <p><u>Discussion Question 2: How do we make sure we uphold a dignified experience for the shoppers?</u></p> <p>FSTF Members:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• No comments/questions <p>Public Comments:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Khadijah: It needs to look like Whole Foods. That experience and the way things look and feel, it needs to have that feel. The way that people are treated in that experience. There needs to be a standard and it needs to look like a business we would want people to come to.2. Anthony Khalil: That is a profound statement. Whole Foods is not just a place, it's a social construct. We are speaking about Southeastern SF. Dignity starts with treating the farmers and workers with dignity. Need to put the spotlight on where our food comes from. That dignity will then be passed on.3. Jennifer Lebarre: Ensure it looks the same as other markets, marketing, displays, etc; Seasonal produce, local produce, highlighting local vendors4. La Shon Walker: The space must be BEAUTIFUL and clean. And like Gus'; It needs to have art on the walls, nice music5. Sean Brooks: Donated food has to be distributed to participants free of charge, per IRS guidelines, or the	
--	--	--

	<p>donor won't get a tax write-off and it's difficult to blend the two models together.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 6. Veronica Shepard: What is HSA's current "dignity lens?" Dignity has a different definition from different populations. So how will HSA bring into the discussion what dignity looks like by race/ethnicity? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cindy Lin shares her own lived experience, and the value of dignity for all communities: We are all San Franciscans at the end of it, and I hope we continue to have these rich conversations. Dignity feels differently to different people across different neighborhoods. I will hold this as a priority conversation. 7. Geoffrea Morris: Whoever the operator is should have a community-driven customer service training. Cleanliness. You notice at Whole Foods how clean the market is. With poor people, there's a feeling of "anything will do." The supervisor had the idea of incorporating whatever the local culture is into the market. Thank you to HSA for the start-up funds. I will be working with the Mayor this budget cycle to ask for more funds for the market. 8. Janna: But I would say Canyon Market in Glen Canyon (small, family owned); Or Good Life in Bernal and Potrero 9. Lyslynn Lacoste: extended hours, large space to accommodate all shoppers, no lines outside the doors 10. Anthony Khalil: It starts with the farmers being treated with dignity. 11. Nikki Pearl: Yes! And what about a Co-op model like Rainbow? 12. Jill Fox: Also look at Rainbow Grocery, which is worker owned, and has grown from a very small store in the Mission to a large market over the years. <p><u>Discussion Question 3: What should be unique about the FEM?</u></p> <p>FSTF Members:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comments/questions <p>Public Comment:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Jennifer Lebarre: The uniqueness should be based on the BVHM community voice <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ agreement from La Shon Walker 	
--	--	--

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Haley Nielsen: Co-located services like cooking classes, homework help 3. Veronica Shepard: Many may already feel dehumanized. People working inside should model the same effort throughout the process 4. Rita Mouton-Patterson: Question. Has there been a conversation with the community about what they want? 5. Jill Fox: Work with the Unions on grocery clerk and other market skill apprentice training, like butchers and warehouse, (so people can work at the FEM and then move onto a union store and make a good wage). 6. SFAAFB Coalition: I'd like to see purchases from social programs from other existing programs like the Black Farmers Association 7. Geoffrea Morris: We want to uphold cleanliness. This has always been about dignity and incorporating the culture of each district. Each district will have a board and liaison and all of that will make the market special for each district. 8. Jill Fox: Consider use of a fillable "swipe" card that people who can afford put money on it and people in need get credit on it, but at the store site, everyone "pays" using the same process. That means that no one knows how people are "paying" and there is no stigma for shopping at this store. And the store staff doesn't have to make the call on eligibility. 9. Anthony Khalil: Dignity is so varied. A new store cannot necessary restore but can build on this intersection of dignity 10. Veronica Shepard: How will respect and dignity be translated with community members as well as staff, managers, supervisors, etc? What equity education will be provided to all those involved in this effort? 11. Khadijah: There needs to be a standard of service and an accountability piece as well. If it is found that people are not being treated with respect within service. 	
<p>8. Community Polling and Feedback, Cindy Lin (HSA Food Coordination Group)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Poll Question: What would you prioritize within the FEM? (Note – 38 participated in the poll – the responses are below) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Free delivery service (doesn't specify meals or groceries) (50%) b. Community kitchen that teaches healthy cooking, restaurant skills, and culinary education (21%) c. Service connection to government and community social services (29%) 2. Poll Question: How should customers "pay" for the food? 	<p>Notes and slides from meeting to be posted online within 10 days.</p>

	<p>(Note – 38 participated in the poll – the responses are below)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Free (26%) b. Tiered Approach (42%) c. Sliding Scale (24%) d. Donations/Contributions (8%) <p>3. Poll Question: How often can someone shop at the market? (Note – 36 participated in the poll – the responses are below)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Weekly (89%) b. Every other week (11%) c. Once a month (0%) <p>4. Poll Question: What are the most important time windows of access? (Note – 34 participated in the poll – the responses are below)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Appointment Only (6%) b. Weekday Mornings (15%) c. Weekday Evenings (35%) d. Weeknights (9%) e. Weekend Mornings (26%) f. Weekend Evenings (9%) g. Weekend Nights (0%) <p>Cissie: Weekends (all day) comes up</p> <p>Public Comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geoffrea (Jah-free-ah) Morris, Legislative Aide for Supervisor Ahsha Safai in the District 11 office. Geoffrea.morris@sfgov.org • Jill Fox: City College has an excellent culinary program, free for SF residents. Work with them instead of reinventing another training program. • Khadijah: It's about the people and the process. If management does not have a lens and hold people accountable then it will be the stay. We need to understand that people will come with there isms, so the standard needs to hold a line and maybe the city can some how be involved if there are complaints. • Lyslynn Lacoste: can you explain the tiered approach again <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cindy re-explained the tiered approach • Sean Brooks: Again, customers couldn't be allowed to pay for product donated by companies who wrote off the donation. 	
--	--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Janna: @sean — if the model is donations, then folks would be supporting the operating expenses and not the food. is that allowed • Sean Brooks: The IRS doesn't allow corporations to write-off donated product that is re-sold. For example, all donated food bank product has to be redistributed free of charge. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cindy Lin: There will be some items that are purchased and those would be the ones that people could pay for. • Bvhpadvocates: As often as they need to. Everyday? Where is that option? (referring to Q3) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cindy Lin: Pilot may look different from fully operational, this is for pilot, we do not understand costs for daily use yet • Discussion in chat about whether afternoons are an option. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cindy Lin: This question focuses on outside normal business hours. • Janna: what's the difference between weekday evenings and weeknights? What about weekend afternoons? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Fiona McBride: We are referencing earlier evenings and late nights. • Bvhpadvocates: What about students? They do shop afternoons? Beyond 8 hours meaning 10 hours or 16 hours? • Cathy Davis: Seniors need daytime and families need evenings <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Janna: I agree with Cathy--seniors need daytime and families need evenings, families may want Saturday afternoons. ○ Lashon agrees with Janna. ○ Lyslynn: Agree w/ Cathy and weekends as well for families • Carolyn Lasar: you will need a combination of these because they apply to different populations all within the shopping area. there will not be just 1 good time • Paula agrees with Cathy and Carolyn. • Sean Brooks: It will be important to cover a range of access windows even if not every day - weekday, weekend and morning to night - at least across a network of FEM's • Geoffrea: Supervisor Safai is seeking for the market to be open 4 to 5 days a week, that includes a week in date and at left a after 5pm time. Example- Wednesday- Saturday (10am to 7pm) 	
--	---	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Janna agreed with Geoffrea. • Haley Nielsen: The families we are serving find it convenient to come get groceries after picking kids up from school • Some participants overall found Poll Question 4 confusing. • DJ: Thank you for having this meeting. Very informative from all who participated. <p>Cindy turns the meeting back to Cissie and Paula. Paula asks if there are next steps people should be aware of. Cindy Lin shares that the RFP will be released in early 2022. The team will review the notes as part of the RFP writing process. The RFP will not include all the rules and program components; some of these rules will be decided once a grantee is selected. Attempting to build a pilot that is as successful as possible in the designated neighborhood.</p> <p>Paula Jones lets everyone know that the meeting slides and minutes will be posted to the Food Security Task Force website.</p> <p>Cindy said that if anyone has comments or would like to share, please send her an email at cindy.lin@sfgov.org</p> <p>La Shon Walker asked for at least one more meeting, and the feedback needs to be shared and incorporated.</p>	
9. Adjournment	Paula adjourned meeting at 4:01pm.	