

Edward A. Chow, M.D.
President

David B. Singer
Vice President

Cecilia Chung
Commissioner

Judith Karshmer, Ph.D., PMHCNS-BC.
Commissioner

David Pating, M.D
Commissioner

David J. Sanchez, Jr., Ph.D.
Commissioner

Belle Taylor-McGhee
Commissioner

**HEALTH COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN
FRANCISCO**

Edwin M. Lee, Mayor
Department of Public Health



Barbara A. Garcia, M.P.A.
Director of Health

Mark Morewitz, M.S.W.
Executive Secretary

TEL (415) 554-2666

FAX (415) 554-2665

Web Site: <http://www.sfdph.org>

MINUTES

JOINT MEETING OF THE HEALTH COMMISSION AND PLANNING COMMISSION

Tuesday, December 4, 2014, 10:00 a.m.
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

1) CALL TO ORDER

Health Commissioners Present:

Commissioner Edward A. Chow M.D. , President
Commissioner Cecilia Chung
Commissioner David Pating, MD
Commissioner David J. Sanchez Jr., Ph.D
Commissioner Belle Taylor-McGhee

Excused:

Commissioner Judith Karshmer, Ph.D, PMHCNS-BC
Commissioner David B. Singer, Vice President

Planning Commissioners Present:

Commissioner Cindy Wu, President
Commissioner Rodney Fong, Vice-President
Commissioner Michael J. Antonini
Commissioner Christine Johnson
Commissioner Kathrin Moore
Commissioner Dennis Richards

Excused:

Commissioner Rich Hillis

Planning Commission President, Cindy Wu, called the meeting to order at 10:07am.

2) CALIFORNIA PACIFIC MEDICAL CENTER (CPMC) ANNUAL COMPLIANCE STATEMENT –

Joint Informational Hearing of the Planning and Health Commissions to review and comment on CPMC's Annual Compliance Statement for 2013 and the City's Report on CPMC's Compliance Statement, in accordance with Section 8.2 of their Development Agreement with the City and County of San Francisco (Planning Department Case No. 2012.0403W; Ordinance No. 138-13). The 2013 Compliance Statement and the City Report are available for viewing on the Planning Department's website (cpmc.sfplanning.org)

Rhonda Simmons, San Francisco Office of Economic Development (OEWD); Elizabeth Watty, Planning Department; Colleen Chawla, San Francisco Department of Public Health (SFDPH); Casey Noel, OEWD; and Ken Rich, OEWD gave the City's presentation. Dr. Warren Browner gave the CPMC presentation.

Public Comment:

Rachel Agora and Jenny Lam from the San Franciscans for Healthcare, Housing, Jobs, and Justice gave a presentation outlining concerns with CPMC being out of compliance with:

- Entry level hiring
- Clipper car transit subsidy obligation
- Provision of specialty care to Tenderloin Residents in a Medi-Cal Managed care program
- Community Responsive Services at St. Luke's Hospital

Chuck Flax, Jewish Vocational Services (JVS), stated that JVS and CPMC have a history of a productive relationship and noted that hiring process has been slower than expected. He added that JVS looks forward to continuing to work with CPMC to make this component work effectively.

Francisco D'Acosta stated that there are many inefficiencies at St. Luke's and other CPMC campuses and added that he is not in support of CPMC.

Dr. Espanola Jackson invited the Health and Planning Commission to visit Bayview Hunter's Point to meet the communities in that neighborhood. She requested that something be done about the number of people who have died of cancer in the neighborhood.

Mary McLucci, CPMC nurse, stated that key services have been cut from the St. Luke's campus and voiced concern that San Francisco is forgetting communities in-need as services continue to disappear.

Miguel Vines stated that he applied for a cook position at CPMC in March and received an interview, but has not heard from them since.

Maria, employee service coordinator for Community Health and Justice, has worked with six clients who applied to open positions at CPMC. None of these individuals were hired nor did they receive any response from CPMC.

Supervisor David Campos stated that CPMC plays an important role in providing healthcare in San Francisco. He voiced concern for healthcare in the Tenderloin, job creation, and transportation for CPMC workers. He urged that proper implementation of the agreement means ensuring that the spirit of the agreement is also followed. He added that this project is an example of how something divisive can bring communities together.

Don Marcos, Director of Mission Hiring Hall, stated that his organization supported the Development Agreement and he expects CPMC to catch up with its hiring practices on this project.

Brian Tseng, Physician's Organizing Committee, stated that CPMC is not meeting its Charity Care targets; their rates are 38% higher than other San Francisco hospitals; CPMC abandoned 100 skilled nursing beds; and fired bilingual staff at the St. Luke's diabetes clinic which services a primarily Latino population. He called on the immediate reinstatement of two of the diabetes clinic staff who were fired and noted the third has found other work. He also called on the Board of Supervisors to review these issues.

Justin Ho, Physician's Organizing Committee, stated that the medical director of the St. Luke's diabetes clinic was given no notification about the firing of bilingual staff. He noted that the replacements do not speak

Spanish; the lack of linguistically and culturally appropriate staff at this clinic puts the health of unborn children at risk.

Tina Guttiani, Northeast Medical Services, stated that many of the patients at the St. Luke's diabetes clinic are monolingual Spanish speaking.

Sarah Kirollac, St. Luke's nurse, stated that she is concerned that medical needs of Tenderloin neighborhood residents are met.

Kim Cavaloni, National Union of Healthcare Workers, stated that Sutter is not honoring the spirit of the Development Agreement. She urged the Commissioners to state that CPMC is not in compliance.

Pam Danenberg, San Francisco Cares, stated that she is a nurse who worked for St. Luke's and lives nearby. She added that Sutter is stripping necessary services like diabetes care, skilled nursing care, and psychiatric services.

Calvin Welch, California Information Clearinghouse, requested that the Commissioners consider allowing for a collateral agreement to help ensure that the Development Agreement works for everyone.

Commissioner Comments:

Commissioner Antonini made the following comments:

- The number of projected jobs was higher than what is actually needed; he encouraged staff of the Planning and Health Departments to closely monitor this benchmark as CPMC moves forward.
- As a Kaiser member, he needs to go to different campuses to receive various kinds of care. He sees the situation of CPMC similarly, even the change of services at St. Luke's. He added that patients should not be charged ambulance fees for having to be transported to different campuses.
- CPMC needs to find partners in the Tenderloin to meet the needs of that neighborhood.
- He encouraged CPMC to make sure there are appropriate translation services at the St. Luke's diabetes clinic.
- He asked for clarification from staff on CPMC's adherence to its Clipper-card related benchmark. Ms. Watty stated that the Development Agreement states that the Clipper card benchmark begins in years two through five. Commissioner Anontoni suggested that CPMC should offer to pay a percentage of the cost of the card instead of reimbursing employees. He urged that this component begin at the beginning of year two of the Development Agreement.

Commissioner Chung stated trust is a main issue at this point in the Development Agreement process and encouraged SFDPH staff to work with CPMC to mitigate concerns. She asked the following questions:

- Why are entry-level positions difficult for CPMC to fill and asked what outreach CPMC has conducted throughout San Francisco's specialty communities? She noted that CPMC did not participate in the LGBT job fair.
- What types of services will St. Luke's provide and will this configuration meet the needs stipulated in the Health Care Services Master Plan?
- How do monolingual patients navigate the CPMC system?

Commissioner Richards made the following comments:

- CPMC is an asset to the City.
- He is concerned that without Spanish-speaking staff in the St. Luke's diabetes clinic, he is not sure how appropriate care is provided.
- Several HIV case managers at the Davies campus were let go; even though it's a personnel issue, it doesn't make sense to the care configuration on that campus.
- He is concerned about the lack of meeting the goal of providing care in the Tenderloin.

- He is unsure about the issue of a collateral agreement and does not know the level of involvement the community should have in monitoring the Development Agreement.
- He is unsure if CPMC is in compliance because there is no specific formula to use.

Commissioner Pating made the following comments:

- There are health equity issues of underserved communities in regard to serving the monolingual patients at the St. Luke's diabetes clinic.
- He is concerned about the lack of movement in finding a partner in the Tenderloin and encouraged CPMC to be proactive on this effort.
- He is unsure why there is a shortfall of MediCal patients being served.

Commissioner Sanchez thanked those who made public comment and the other Commissioners for their thoughts and made the following comments:

- Providing incentives to employees (including interns) is vital to not impact traffic in the City.
- There should be more discussion on how to meet the medical needs of the 1,500 Tenderloin residents.
- St. Luke's hospital is located in a neighborhood that continues to be predominantly Latino with many monolingual patients.

Commissioner Moore made the following comments:

- Encouraged everyone to prepare for a full compliance evaluation next year including integrity and issues related to healthy equity.
- She expected CPMC to be proactive in dealing with all the issues brought forth by other Commissioners and expects to see stellar performance by CPMC next year.
- She is looking for an increase in CPMC's sensitivity to cultural and linguistic issues in their compliance next year. She added that accuracy of language in regard to healthcare provision is vital for effectiveness.

Commissioner Wu stated that the hiring benchmarks in the report were for 2013, but some data from 2014 was included in the report. She asked if the data needs to be reconciled and noted that the compliance report is based on the data of the Development Agreement, not a calendar year. Emylene Aspilla, Director of Strategic Initiatives at Office of Economic and Workforce Development stated that 13 jobs relate to a shortfall from the first year of the Development Agreement and need to be rolled over. Data from the current year show a positive trend of CPMC hiring.

Commissioner Taylor-McGhee-thanked everyone who spoke and said the public testimony was informative. She said the hiring benchmark is a social justice issue and stated that CPMC is responsible for removing structuring obstacles to hiring San Francisco residents.

Commissioner Richards encouraged CPMC to give feedback to individuals who apply for jobs.

Commissioner Chow thanked staff, those who made public comments, and CPMC representatives, on behalf of the Health and Planning Commissions. He stated that the Planning Department and Health Department Directors, and their staff, will need to weigh-in on many issues over the next nine years to determine whether CPMC is in compliance. He added that this project is not intended just to create jobs but to deliver the care necessary to meet the needs of San Franciscans. It is important that CPMC be part of a system that ensures that the most vulnerable populations are provided necessary care; this includes people living in the Tenderloin, Mission, and Chinatown neighborhoods. He asked the SFDPH to use the Health Commission resolution 2-10, "Resolution Memorializing the Agreements Reached by the Health Commission and CPMC Regarding Its Institutional Master Plan," in addition to the Development Agreement, to monitor CPMC. He hopes when the Planning and Health Commissions convene in a year that CPMC will be in full compliance. He looks forward to

reports to the Health Commission throughout the year to keep the Commissioners informed of the progress of this project.

Planning Department Director, John Raiham thanked everyone in attendance. He stated that the issues he heard from both Commissions are the following:

- Low rates of hiring San Francisco residents for entry level jobs
- Cultural and linguistic services at St. Luke's Hospital, with a focus on the diabetes clinic
- Charity care
- Healthcare in the Tenderloin

SFDPH Director Barbara Garcia stated that she looks forward to work with Planning Department and the two Commissions on this monitoring of CPMC. She added that SFDPH will work with CPMC to address the issues specified during the hearing and that the healthcare needs of Tenderloin residents can be met. She also stated that she wants to work closely with CPMC to ensure that the new hospital will provide appropriate care for MediCal patients.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:43pm.