MINUTES
JOINT MEETING OF THE HEALTH COMMISSION AND PLANNING COMMISSION
Tuesday, September 28, 2017, 10:00 a.m.
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

1) CALL TO ORDER
Health Commissioners Present:
Commissioner Edward A. Chow M.D. President
Commissioner Dan Bernal
Commissioner Judith Karshmer, Ph.D., PMHCNS-BC
Commissioner James Loyce, Jr. M.S.
Commissioner David Pating, MD
Commissioner David J. Sanchez Jr., Ph.D.

Excused:
Commissioner Cecilia Chung

Planning Commissioners Present:
Commissioner Rich Hillis, President
Commissioner Rodney Fong
Commissioner Christine Johnson
Commissioner Joel Koppel
Commissioner Myra Melgar
Commissioner Kathrin Moore

Excused:
Commissioner Dennis Richards

Planning Commission President, Rich Hillis, called the meeting to order at 10:08am.

2) CALIFORNIA PACIFIC MEDICAL CENTER (CPMC) ANNUAL COMPLIANCE STATEMENT –
Joint Informational Hearing of the Planning and Health Commissions to review and comment on CPMC’s Annual Compliance Statement for 2016 and the City’s Report on CPMC’s Compliance Statement, in accordance with Section 8.2 of their Development Agreement with the City and County of San Francisco (Planning Department Case No. 2012.0403W; Ordinance No. 138-13). The 2016 Compliance Statement and the City Report are available for viewing on the Planning Department’s website (cpmc.sfplanning.org)
Elizabeth Purl, Planning Department; Krishna Patel, San Francisco Department of Public Health (SFDPH); Joshua Arce, CityBuild; and Jim Maxude, CPMC, presented.

Public Comment:
Ann Ludwig stated that her husband has advanced Alzheimer’s Disease and has lived at CPMC Swindell’s Residential Care program for several years. She learned in August that CPMC will close the unit of vulnerable and fragile patients; moving these individuals can be destabilizing and dangerous. She urged CPMC to continue their role in caring for these patients.

Dawn Astorga stated that her mother is a patient at Swindell’s Unit. She noted that the staff are excellent and care has been stellar. However, CPMC has offered no referrals or assistance with discharge planning for the patients.

Victoria Kleemann stated that her mother suffered greatly for two years before coming to Swindell’s, where she has found a sense of normalcy through the loving care of the staff.

Linda Rosario stated that her mother is 103 and has lived at the Swindell unit for two years. She noted that other similar facilities cost $8-10 thousand per month which is unaffordable for many of the residents.

Phil Faris stated that his wife is a resident of the Swindell’s unit; she cannot speak or walk and receives wonderful care from the loving staff who can intuit her needs. He is very concerned about where she can go if the unit closes.

Shari Grapper stated that her deceased husband used to live at the Swindell’s unit. She added the San Francisco needs more of these types of units and requested that CPMC not close the unit.

Alisha Powell is a CityBuild graduate. She stated that the CPMC Van Ness/Gear campus project has helped her advance a carpentry career. She is very appreciative of the training and opportunities.

Elba Ochomagoi is a CityBuild graduate who immigrated to the United States from Nicaragua four years ago. He added the CPMC encourages diversity and hires people for whom English is a second language.

Terry Watter is a CityBuild graduate and works at the St. Luke’s campus. Prior to her involvement with CityBuild, she was low-income and struggling but she no longer needs assistance and is proud to be helping to building the new hospital.

Mercedes Winnfield is a resident of San Francisco and stated that her involvement in First Sources gave her full employment and changed her life. She is thankful for the opportunities the program has given her.

Asganio Piomelli, Hastings College of Law Dean, stated that he hopes the annual meeting of the Planning and Health Commissions is not just a “box checking” exercise to indicate that CPMC has met the most minimum standards included in the Development Agreement. Instead, he hopes the two Commissions take the opportunity to review all relevant issues to ensure CPMC is meeting its responsibilities to the greater San Francisco community.

Dr. Teresa Palmer MD, geriatrician, stated that more detail is needed in the CPMC reporting to better understand more about its MediCal patients. She noted that CPMC has a history of doing little in its community outreach efforts. She added that it is a violation of CPMC’s mission statement to close skilled nursing facilities.

Ken Barnes MD, worked as physician at St. Luke’s Hospital for over 30 years, stated that in 2014 all bilingual and bicultural staff at the St. Luke’s Diabetes clinic were fired even though the patient population was mostly Spanish-speaking; sixty-six of the patients were monolingual. He added that patients must use the telephone to make an appointment because the receptionist position was eliminated. He would like the public to have better understanding if there has been a change in utilization by the previous patients due to these changes. He also
stated that he would like to hold the SFPDH and other hospitals accountable to ensure there are subacute services available in San Francisco.

Gordon Mar, Director of Jobs with Justice, thanked the families of the St. Luke’s Subacute unit and Swindell’s Family Council for speaking up for their loved ones. He stated that the Coalition would like to see more detailed reports so the annual compliance process has meaning and can be used to help public dialogue. He added that data should include tracking of entry level hires and retention.

Michael Lyon, long term San Francisco and former ZSFG employee, stated that over 600 patients have been sent out of county because CPMC refused to accept them. He challenged the statement that CPMC has met its goals and added that CPMC must admit new subacute patients.

Tony Rivera stated that his sister is a patient in the St. Luke’s Hospital Subacute unit. He is upset that the unit will be moved and requested that CPMC offer transportation to family members. He added that he does not understand why CPMC does not offer better communication to patients and their families around the plans for the unit.

Katy Rose, asked for more information regarding how the transit fare program is being implemented. She urged both Commissions to pay attention to the staffing levels at CPMC SNF, including subacute, units because CPMC has deliberately reduced staffing levels without notice to the patients or the SFDPh.

Kim Tavaglione, National Union of Healthcare Workers, stated that CPMC has a history of doing the least it can do to meet minimum requirements; as a tax-exempt hospital, it should provide exemplary care. She urged the Commissioners to speak up for the patients of the Swindell’s and Subacute units. She also stated that there need to be more SNF beds in San Francisco and increased coordinated transportation between CPMC campuses for those who need specialty care.

Mark Aronson, UC Hasting Professor, stated that the Development Agreement (DA) has many good things but is silent on many issues. The document should not be used as an excuse by CPMC to not be responsive to its current patients or the San Francisco community. He added that the monitoring of the DA is not meant to be a checklist but instead to look in depth at what CPMC is doing.

Zeke Montejano, St. Anthony’s Clinic director, stated that the organization is aggressively outreaching to the 3,200 people accessing their meals and other services daily, to recruit for the clinic.

Ingrid Merriwether, CEO of Meriweathers and Williams Insurance, stated that the company has appreciated the work on the Van Ness/Geary campus and has been given additional projects related to parking coordination.

Commissioner Comments:
Commissioner Fong asked for more information regarding the impending Swindell’s unit closure. Mr. Maxude stated that families of residents of the Swindell’s unit were notified that the unit will likely close in late 2018 due to the sale of the California campus buildings. He added that the manager of the unit is working with families regarding discharge and transition. He added that CPMC is working with other providers to find a suitable solution.

Commissioner Koppel stated that it is important to recognize the impactful work of CityBuild on training and hiring San Francisco residents. He noted that he participated in a press conference with Mayor Lee and Nancy Pelosi to showcase the programs’ training opportunities.

Commissioner Pating congratulated CPMC on many of its successes in its annual report. He asked whether the CPMC partnerships with NEMS and St. Anthony’s will be hospital-based. Emily Webb, CPMC Director of Community Health Programs, stated that NEMS has seven clinics providing primary care; St. Anthony’s clinic is their newest primary care site. CPMC will provide hospital-based services and specialty care for the patients in this partnership.
Commissioner Pating asked if all the CPMC campuses will have an emergency department. Ms. Webb stated that all of the San Francisco CPMC campuses will have Emergency Departments.

Commissioner Pating asked for more information regarding the plan to attain the projected 1,500 clients in the partnership with NEMS/St. Anthony’s Medical Clinic. Ms. Webb stated that the partnership was forged at the end of 2015 after much of the enrollment for the Affordable Care Act.

Commissioner Pating asked if the majority of these patients are expected to be Medical/Medicare. Ms. Webb confirmed that this is target group for the partnership.

Commissioner Pating asked for more information regarding the status of the St. Luke’s Hospital Diabetes clinic. Ms. Webb stated that CPMC has hired a Spanish-speaking registered dietitian and educator.

Commissioner Pating asked whether a Prop. Q hearing is scheduled for the closure of the Swindell’s unit. Ms. Webb stated that the residential unit patients have medical care provided by home health services and is licensed through the Department of Social Services. She noted that a Proposition Q hearing will be scheduled when appropriate.

Commissioner Moore stated that she is disturbed by the public comments regarding the status of the St. Luke’s Subacute unit and Swindell’s unit. Commissioner Chow stated the Health Commission and Board of Supervisors held several hearings on the possible closure of the St. Luke’s Hospital Subacute Unit. He noted that the Hospital Council of Northern California has created a Post-Acute Care Collaborative to create recommendations which include the need of subacute patients. He also noted that prior to the Development Agreement between CPMC and the City of San Francisco, CPMC had agreed to include 100 SNF beds. He also stated that the Health Commission has requested that the SFDPH continue to work on these issues to ensure there is proper planning for the needs of San Franciscans.

Commissioner Sanchez stated that there has been much public comment regarding the high quality of care by the St. Luke’s Subacute Unit staff. He added that St. Luke’s has been a key partner in providing critical services to vulnerable populations in the area. He questioned whether the renaming of the campus will bring a new mission for the hospital. His understanding is that St. Luke’s would have a Center of Excellence for Senior Services; this would mean that there must be culturally and linguistically appropriate services provided to the target communities. Mr. Maxude stated that the CPMC mission remains the same: to provide the highest quality of care with culturally and linguistically appropriate services. The Senior Center of Excellence, included in the Development Agreement, will include a health program with acute care for the elderly, with spaces designed for use with the target population. He added that CPMC is working on additional programmatic support that will bridge its hospital services with community services. He noted that the name was changed because there was confusion regarding where services would be located. CPMC asked communities what name would be most helpful and their responses indicated that including neighborhood information would be most helpful.

Commissioner Karshmer stated that she celebrates the progress CPMC has made on the Development Agreement. She agreed with the public commenter who stated that CPMC should do more than check off required boxes for its annual report on progress of the Development Agreement. She also noted that some recommendations regarding the St. Luke’s Diabetes clinic were not followed and suggested that it would have been helpful to explain why the hiring of bilingual staff took several years and other lessons learned in this project and the NEMS/St. Anthony’s Partnership.

Commissioner Bernal stated that providing culturally and linguistically appropriate services are a high priority. He noted that bi-cultural and bi-lingual staff have been hired and asked if there is any data from the patient survey to help give context to the patient population’s satisfaction with changes made. Mr. Maxude stated that the survey results reflected that patients did not have concern regarding whether there is a receptionist present.
Commissioner Loyce asked if the CityBuild Program has data showing the length of employment for this group. Mr. Arce stated that he can provide retention data from the people trained and hired on the construction side but does not have data for other types of participants.

Commissioner Hillis asked for more information regarding pedestrian and transportation developments. Jose Young, CPMC, stated that CPMC is partnering with the MTA on all improvements. CPMC plans to complete all streetscape projects prior to opening of the Van Ness/Geary campus. The relevant projects for the Mission/Bernal campuses will be completed for phase one of the opening.

Commissioner Chow stated that the Health Department and SFDPH may need to collaborate further in regard to planning for future SNF, including subacute, services in San Francisco. He is pleased that staff have found that CPMC is in compliance with the Development Agreement for 2016. He noted that recent actions by CPMC regarding the St. Luke’s Subacute Unit, indicate that it is willing to work with patients and families. He hopes that CPMC can work with the families of the Swindell Unit before the matter comes before the Health Commission in a Prop. Q hearing. He requested that Director Garcia continue to work with CPMC on issues related to cultural and linguistic appropriate service delivery. He urged CPMC to go beyond CLAS minimum standards and strive to meet the needs of its patient populations. In regard to the survey of St. Luke’s Diabetes Clinic patients, he asked whether the survey data reflects the experience of those patients who no longer feel comfortable accessing services at the clinic due to language issues. He also stated that the Health Commission looks forward to the completion of the new hospital buildings and hopes CPMC will strive to meet the needs of the entire San Francisco community.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:33pm.