MINUTES
HEALTH COMMISSION MEETING
Tuesday September 1, 2020 4:00 p.m.
Remote Meeting via Webex Event

1) CALL TO ORDER
Present: Commissioner Laurie Green, MD, Vice President
Commissioner Cecilia Chung
Commissioner Edward A. Chow M.D.
Commissioner Susan Belinda Christian, J.D.
Commissioner Suzanne Giraudo, Ph.D
Commissioner Tessie Guillermo

Excused: Commissioner Dan Bernal President

The meeting was called to order at 4:04pm.

2) APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE HEALTH COMMISSION MEETING OF AUGUST 18, 2020

Commissioner Comments:
Commissioner Guillermo stated that she was not present at the 8/18/20 meeting. Mr. Morewitz stated that he would make this correction on the final minutes.

Action Taken: The Health Commission unanimously approved the minutes with the correction noted above.

3) Grant Colfax, Director of Health, gave the report, which can be viewed at:
http://www.sfdph.org/dph/comupg/aboutdph/insideDept/dirRpts/default.asp

State Governor announces a new tiered system for reopening
On August 28, the State announced a new tiered system for reopening. San Francisco is currently reviewing the State’s new tiered system for reopening and how it impacts the City’s future reopening. The Department of Public Health will review the changes to the State watch list and return next week with any impacts on how the City will move forward.
San Francisco to Resume Outdoor Personal Services Starting September 1

Today, there are over 9,500 San Francisco residents with confirmed cases of COVID-19. And, sadly, a total of 83 San Franciscans have died. The San Francisco Department of Public Health (DPH) sends our condolences to their loved ones.

On August 28, Mayor London N. Breed and Dr. Grant Colfax, Director of Public Health, announced that outdoor personal services will resume in San Francisco, effective Tuesday, September 1, 2020. Outdoor gyms and fitness centers can reopen starting September 9, 2020. Additionally, the Mayor and Dr. Colfax announced that once San Francisco is removed from the State’s watch list, the City’s top priorities for reopening will be the gradual opening of classrooms, services that support the development of children, and other activities that can occur outdoors.

Outdoor personal services that can operate include haircuts, barber services, massages and nail services. Only those services where both clients and providers can be masked at all times are allowed to resume. The City has posted information and guidance in multiple languages for businesses and is conducting outreach to personal services businesses to ensure they have access to the guidance and are able to prepare accordingly.

The San Francisco Department of Public Health (DPH) will continue to monitor the spread of COVID-19 infection as more of the city population circulates and interacts, and will keep reviewing the City’s Key Public Health Indicators to ensure San Francisco’s gradual reopening and allowance of outdoor personal services does not drive a surge in infections and hospitalizations.

Once San Francisco is off the State’s watch list and DPH determines it is safe to begin reopening, the City’s gradual reopening will focus on equity and safety, opening those areas with the least risk while helping those who are suffering as a result of the Stay Home Order. Schools, community hubs and after-school programs provide a critical source of support for children, youth, and their families, and helped mitigate socio-economic disparities through school meal programs and social, physical, behavioral, and mental health services. Therefore, returning children to learning environments, whether it is a classroom, a Community Hub, or after school program, remains a top priority for the City.

Since San Francisco remains on the State’s watch list, in-classroom learning can continue only for elementary schools with a waiver from DPH. Over 50 schools have notified DPH of their desire to apply for waivers for in-classroom learning. Waiver applications are available for distribution this week.

Focused enrollment for the City’s Community Hubs began this week and is offered to select families based on priority population criteria, which includes HOPE SF, public housing; homeless youth; foster care youth; English language learners; low-income African American, Latino, Pacific Islander and Asian families.

Department of Public Health Fiscal Year 20-21 Budget Update

On August 27, the Board’s Budget and Appropriations Committee amended and passed the Mayor’s approved budget out of committee for consideration at the full Board. Overall DPH’s budget remains at $2.8 billion for FY 2020-21 and $2.4 billion in FY 2021-22, with only minor changes described below. We are pleased that our proposed initiatives remain intact and additional critical services have been funded, and are grateful for the support we have received from the Mayor’s Office and Board of Supervisors.

As part of the review by the Budget and Legislative Analyst, DPH’s budget was reduced by $4.3 million in FY 2019-2020 and $1.9 million in FY 2020-2021. The proposed reductions cuts are at a similar level those of prior years and represent less than 1% of DPH’s total budget. They are administrative in nature and will not affect our ability to deliver services or our ability to provide an effective COVID response.
Offsetting the reductions, the Board of Supervisors allocated back $4.6 million in FY 2020-21 and $2.0 million in FY 21-22 for services at DPH. The programs initially assigned to DPH are outlined below. As in prior years, we will validate the final allocation of services in the Board of Supervisors spending plans over the next week and will update you if this list changes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>20-21</th>
<th>21-22</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expansion of Maternal Child Health Programs to improve health outcomes of Black African American children and mothers, including doula support and supplemental income</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support for healthcare workers at health centers in the Mission</td>
<td>130,000</td>
<td>130,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support for gender affirming primary care, gynecological care, and mental health services for cisgender women and transgender people</td>
<td>1,200,000</td>
<td>1,200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COVID testing at Community Hubs</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campaigns for safer streets for those most impacted by pedestrian safety issues, including children, communities of color, people with disabilities, and seniors in District 5</td>
<td>15,000</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$ 4,345,000</td>
<td>$ 3,330,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The budget will now move to the Full Board for two hearings on September 15th and September 22nd. We will continue to keep you posted should there be any further changes to the budget.

San Francisco residents to stay home during poor air quality conditions
San Francisco is experiencing unusually hazy and smoky air as a result of the multiple fires currently burning throughout California, including in the northern counties and Santa Cruz county. The air quality in our area changes daily and throughout the day as it is dependent on wind speed and direction. Air quality may improve at times or worsen and very quickly. We are closely monitoring the Air Quality Index and are prepared if our air quality index changes.

Even during days of poor air quality conditions, we must continue to protect ourselves and our community from COVID-19. During poor air quality conditions and COVID-19, the best and healthiest thing for everyone to do now to avoid exposure to outdoor air and the virus by staying indoors as much as possible. If you must leave your home and go out for essential activity, remember to bring your face coverings and socially distance from people outside of your household to protect yourself and your community from COVID-19.

In addition to staying indoors, check on your friends, family and neighbors - especially those people in your life who are older, pregnant, have respiratory illness or are children. These are individuals who are at great risk of elevated air pollution levels and should take precautions to avoid exposure.

As we enter the wildfire season, active wildfires and changing wind patterns will impact our air quality for more days to come. We must all take actions to protect ourselves and our community from the elements such as extreme heat, poor air quality and during this pandemic, COVID-19. We continue to find ways to protect each other and our community and we will continue to rise to the occasion.

DPH in the News
Mission Local, Aug 31 2020, State sends huge stash of PPE to San Francisco – supplies handed out in the Mission

SF Examiner, Aug 31 2020, Fata drug overdoses soar to 441 in SF in 2019, new report shows
Cronkite News, Aug 28 2020, COVID-19 work-arounds are silver linings for homeless programs

SF Business Times, Aug 28 2020, SF officials to allow outdoor reopening at salons, gyms, starting next week

SF Chronicle, Aug 28 2020, San Francisco clears barbershops, nail salons and gyms to open outdoors, just in time for wildfire smoke
https://www.sfchronicle.com/business/article/San-Francisco-to-resume-outdoor-personal-services-15522509.php

SF Chronicle, Aug 28 2020, Bay briefing: hotels sheltering wildfire evacuees – and a bird or two

SF Chronicle, Aug 28 2020, SF and Napa schools could get green light to open in two weeks
https://www.sfchronicle.com/education/article/16-000-SF-students-headed-to-learning-hubs-or-15522487.php#photo-14405696

SF Examiner, Aug 28 2020, Health officials to begin taking waiver applications from elementary schools

SF Public Press, Aug 28 2020, What crowding looks like during a pandemic: dismal days in the Tenderloin

Mission Local, Aug 25 2020, Carnaval 2020 aims to test 2,000 people for COVID for free

SF Examiner, Aug 25 2020, SF speeds up jail closure to early September

SF Chronic, Aug 24 2020, Does racism make us sick? Amid a national reckoning, the question gains new importance

SF Public Press, Aug 24 2020, Air pollution worsens COVID-19, but Bay Area emissions limits are unchanged

KQED, Aug 21 2020, Masks for smoke and COVID-19 – what kind is best?

Mission Local, Aug 21 2020, Nurses demand sheriffs’ discharge from San Francisco General Hospital

SF Examiner, Aug 21 2020, Mental-health crisis teams could replace police response

Los Angeles Times, Aug 20 2020, Bay Area has the world’s worst air quality thanks to this week’s Northern California fires
SF News, Aug 20, 2020, San Francisco will no longer have high-end dining domes
https://www.thesfnews.com/san-francisco-will-no-longer-have-high-end-dining-domes/64019

SF Chronicle, Aug 19 2020, If COVID-19 isn’t driving a dramatic increase in homeless deaths in SF, then what is?

Commissioner Comments:
Commissioner Chow noted that accurate and accessible air quality information is important during this time and stated that the link at SF72.org did not direct him to the correct air quality information. He suggested that air quality and COVID-19 information be shared on the same page. Dr. Colfax stated that the City continues to improve its website to ensure the public has access to relevant health data.

4) COVID-19 UPDATE
Grant Colfax, MD, DPH Director of Health; Tomas Aragon, MD, Health Officer and Director of Population Health; and Ana Validzic, COVID-19 Team Lead for Schools and Childcare, presented the item.

Public Comment:
Dr. Teresa Palmer stated that she would like to address the ongoing isolation of nursing home patients and asked why the appropriate Health Officer Order has not been revised to allow any visitation on the premises. She noted that the state has much more liberal visitation guidelines than the City. This is a violation of human rights.

A caller stated that there are no guidelines to reopen his restaurant, which only has indoor seating. They had been prepared with all the necessary cleaning protocols and PPE for staff. There is no sidewalk area at his business to operate outdoors and the air quality would have impacted outdoor dining. His life’s work is gone and he has had to close his business. He and his family will be leaving San Francisco.

Dean, fitness center owner, stated that other businesses have been given priority over fitness businesses. He noted that there are many logistical safety measures that could be utilized to safely open indoor fitness businesses. He noted contradictions in the State policy and the City policy in this regard. He also noted that he has tried to reach out to many officials in the City government but has only found roadblocks.

Michael Ryan stated his support of Dr. Palmer’s comments regarding the lack of visitation at nursing homes. He noted that the Grey Panthers and Seniors with Disability Action groups are upset that no visitors, including the Ombudsman, can visit these facilities, especially when the state has said this could happen.

Shawna, parent and owner of a fitness business, thanked the DPH for its work on business and school reopening. She added that the public needs to hear that San Francisco is not reopening because of political pressure, not safety concerns. She also stated that it is important to let the public know that the whole City will not be shut down if a school or business has COVID-19 cases after reopening.

A caller stated that the state has classified San Francisco as red but the City has chosen not to offer indoor personal services. She noted that it seems unfair that dental and Botox services are offered indoors but not hair salons. She asked if there is educational bias involved in these decisions because hair stylists need less education than a dentist. She added that the number of homeless people on the streets, air quality, and pedestrians are obstacles to operating outdoors. She also stated that because neighboring counties are offering these services, San Franciscans are likely to travel and expose themselves to more people.

Evan, owner of a personal nutrition business, asked why some businesses are still closed. He also asked why there is no guidance on eating and exercise to survive during the COVID-19 pandemic. He noted that the Police
gym is open and retail stores are open. There is no science justifying keeping his industry closed. He also stated that his business is by appointment only and contact tracing is easy to do for his clientele.

Rayana teaches Pilates to underserved communities. She has seen numerous Black studio owners close their businesses. She stated that many of her clients need Pilates as part of physical therapy but it is not possible to move the heavy Pilates equipment outdoors. She urged the City to rethink its policy regarding Pilates businesses.

Dave, MX3 fitness co-owner, stated that he is pleased that gyms and personal training can resume outdoor services later this month. He noted that group fitness is absent from the Health Order. He questioned why religious worship in groups is okay but not group fitness classes. He also requested that indoor gym services resume with appropriate safety guidelines.

DeeDee Crossert, Owner of San Francisco Institute of Aesthetics and Cosmetology and partner on Skin on Market, stated that her business goal is to prevent disease. It makes no sense that these services cannot open with appropriate safety guidelines. She noted that current conditions involving unhoused individuals in the area make it impossible to conduct their education services outside. She noted that in an online comment, Dr. Aragon noted that the business is low risk.

Tracey Sylvester, Pilates business owner, stated that many clients come to her for rehabilitation. She noted that Pilates is low impact and involves slow precise movements which are very different then gyms. She asked that Pilates not be grouped with gyms.

A caller stated that fitness of all types is essential. The state has allowed gyms to open at 10% capacity but the City is not allowing these businesses to reopen.

Sehyan Shah, resident of Bayside Village, called to address resident safety during construction. Residents have been exposed to many safety risks, including lack of COVID-19 safety precautions. There has been minimal action. He asked that the Department of Building Inspection be given the authority to enforce construction safety violations.

**Commissioner Comments:**
Commissioner Giraudo requested clear guidelines on school outdoor sports. Dr. Aragon stated that individuals in protected cohorts may interact in outdoor activities but it is not recommended that those outside of these cohorts play sports together.

Commissioner Chow noted that outdoor seating is allowed at restaurants but is unsure of the timeline for reinstating indoor restaurant seating. He also asked for information regarding outdoor playgrounds. Dr. Aragon stated that aerosolization of the virus is a concern with indoor restaurant dining due to lack of ventilation. He added that playgrounds bring people from many households together which could increase the likelihood of contamination.

Commissioner Chow asked for more information regarding the determination that certain number of people in a cohort are safe. Dr. Aragon stated that the state guidelines for children’s activity pods is 14 people.
Commissioner Chow thanked Dr. Aragon and noted the importance of the context of this information so the public can better understand the guidelines.

Commissioner Green asked if there is a place on the DPH website that explains the Health Officer Orders in simple language. Dr. Aragon stated that the City recognizes that improvements are needed in areas of communication strategies for COVID-19 policies.
Commissioner Giraudo asked for more information regarding the DPH work with the San Francisco Unified School District (SFUSD). She noted concern for the disparity that some private schools have resources to reopen and public schools currently do not. Validzic stated that all schools, including the SFUSD, had to submit the same application to reopen. She noted that the DPH meets weekly with the SFUSD leadership; the SFUSD leaders decided on their own to use distance learning this semester.

Commissioner Guillermo stated that there is a need for clear communication to the public and all stakeholders impacted by the various Health Orders and guidances. She noted that it does not seem that impacted stakeholders have had the opportunity to engage in communication with the City regarding these orders that impact them. A robust information sharing process would help the public understand why some guidelines pertain to certain businesses and groups, but not others. She noted improving communication with the community is a priority.

Commissioner Chow agrees that there is a need for improvement in communication regarding the logic of decisions related to Health Officer Orders and reopening.

Commissioner Chow requested more information regarding the SRO COVID-19 strategy at a future meeting.

Dr. Colfax stated that the DPH and City continue to focus on stopping the spread of the virus while balancing the need for reopening businesses. He noted that City leadership is aware that there are many important issues beyond the medical issues of COVID-19. He added that he is hearing from the comments from the public and Commission that there is a need for increased clarity.

5) **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**
The Caller suggested that the DPH not just focus on COVID-19 and instead take into account mental health and housing. She noted that many of the COVID-19 related health orders impact other health issues such as in-person visits with physicians.

Murali Vajapeyam stated that gym and pool facilities in Bayside Village are not open but the rent does not go down.

6) **FINANCE AND PLANNING COMMITTEE UPDATE**
Commissioner Chung, Chair, stated that the Committee recommended that the full Health Commission approve the Contracts Report and new contract request. She also stated that the Committee requested increased contract outcomes to be reported at the Finance and Planning Committee meetings.

7) **CONSENT CALENDAR**

**Action Taken:** The Health Commission unanimously approved the following:

- **SEPTEMBER 2020 CONTRACTS REPORT**
- **REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF A NEW CONTRACT WITH PHFE dba HELUNA HEALTH, IN THE AMOUNT OF $7,000,000 (INCLUDING CONTINGENCY), TO ASSIST THE DEPARTMENT IN DELIVERING CASE INVESTIGATION AND CONTACT TRACING (CICT), AND OUTBREAK MANAGEMENT SUPPORT SERVICES IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19.**

8) **DPH OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE AND PRIVACY AFFAIRS FY19-20 ANNUAL REPORT**
Maggie Rykowski, Office of Compliance and Privacy Affairs Director and Garrett Chatfield Deputy Director, Office of Compliance and Privacy Affairs Deputy Director, presented the item.
Public Comment
Dr. Derek Kerr stated that page 16 of the report shows the number of Whistleblower complaints but no results of the investigations such as how many claims were substantiated. He noted that outcomes of these investigations would show the integrity of the Whistleblower program.

Commissioner Comments:
Commissioner Chow asked if the behavioral health audits are being completed during this time. Mr. Chatfield stated that the audits were halted in the early months of the COVID-19 pandemic but were restarted on August 1st.

Commissioner Chow requested that future reports include Whistleblower outcomes.

Commissioner Guillermo asked if the behavioral health services disallowances were related to fraud. Mr. Chatfield stated that no fraud was found; the disallowances were related to documentation issues.

Commissioner Guillermo stated that it would be helpful to know for future reports whether the documentation issues are related to a few providers are indicative of a system-wide issue.

Commissioner Christian asked for clarification regarding the audit process. Mr. Chatfield stated that his office ensures that claims are valid. He noted that quality is assessed by other DPH sections. He also stated that during this round of assessments, there were some quality issues that were noted so his office is working with Behavioral Health Services around these issues.

Commissioner Christian asked if the audit results are reviewed as part of the contract approval and renewal process. Mr. Chatfield stated that he is unclear on whether this information is considered during the contract approval process. Mr. Morewitz stated that he would check with the DPH Business Office to determine if this information is reviewed as part of a contract approval process.

Commissioner Green asked for more information regarding audit findings. Mr. Garrett stated that the general issue was confusion on coding issues. The DPH is providing increased education to address this issue.

Commissioner Green asked if the Office of Compliance and Privacy has looked at how EPIC prompts could be helpful in decreasing coding errors. Mr. Chatfield stated that the DPH is looking to develop criteria for staff to use the “Break the Glass” function in EPIC.

9) DPH HUMAN RESOURCES UPDATE FY19-20
Michael Brown, DPH Human Resources Director, presented the item.

Commissioner Comments:
Commissioner Chung noted that in the for-profit world, there is a trend to create workplace culture positions. She asked how the DPH addresses interpersonal conflict and issues of diversity in its workforce. Mr. Brown stated that the DPH Human Resources Workforce Development unit provides trainings to address many issues. He introduced Richa Dhanju, MSW, Ph.D, DPH HR People Development Team. Ms. Dhanju stated that the DPH HR understands that individuals work best when they feel they belong. The unit provides trainings on effective communication in diverse teams and training managers on hiring a diverse workforce. She added that employee surveys will begin in October and an all-DPH employee survey will be launched in 2021.

Commissioner Chung stated that we are living in an unprecedented time and asked what support is offered to DPH employees to cope with the escalated stress due to external issues such as COVID-19 and the fires in addition from working from home. Mr. Brown stated that the Employee Assistance Program is available 24/7. Ms. Dhanju stated that new employees are trained to understand a trauma informed system. There are also confidential one-on-one sessions with managers to address stress-related issues.
Commissioner Chung stated she has much respect for all DPH employees. She noted particular concern for those administrative staff who have been activated to conduct frontline work.

Commissioner Christian thanked Mr. Brown for his thought-provoking presentation. She stated that during this time of dealing with COVID-19 and many inequities is it especially important to support the health and well-being of DPH, who are responsible for caring for the people of San Francisco. She also stated interest in regular Human Resource updates.

Commissioner Christian stated that she is not sure how much training managers receive and how much accountability they must show for the areas they supervise. Mr. Brown stated that the Director of the City’s Human Resource Department is retiring so a new Director will be hired. He noted that he has been working with other CCSF Departments to discuss issues related to diversity. He added that more work is needed to ensure all managers understand the responsibilities as we see a shift in our work culture.

Dr. Colfax thanked Mr. Brown for his leadership.

10) **EPIC UPDATE**
This item was postponed until the September 15, 2020 meeting.

11) **OTHER BUSINESS:**
Mr. Morewitz announced that the October 1st joint meeting the Planning Commission to review the Health Care Services Master Plan has been postponed until 2021.

12) **ADJOURNMENT**
The meeting was adjourned at 7:23 pm.